

May 28, 2019

ASHE2019 Webinar Episode 3 - Indigeneity, Imagination, & Inspiration for Higher Education with Dr. Adrienne Keene (Cherokee), Dr. Megan Bang (Ojibwe) and Cheryl Crazy Bull (Sicangu Lakota). Hosted by Dr. Amanda Tachine (Diné)



**INDIGENEITY, IMAGINATION,
& INSPIRATION FOR HIGHER
EDUCATION**

This webinar will bring together Indigenous educational leaders to discuss the complexities of Indigeneity in higher education and reimagine possibilities and futures that inspire how we may consider practice, policy, and research.

EPISODE THREE

Amanda R. Tachine (Diné)
2019 ASHE
Webinar Series Host

Adrienne Keene, (Cherokee)
Assistant Professor
Brown University

Megan Bang (Ojibwe)
Professor, Northwestern
University & Senior Vice
President, Spencer Foundation

Cheryl Crazy Bull (Sicangu Lakota)
President and Chief Executive Officer
American Indian College Fund

TUESDAY, MAY 28, 2019 2:00 PM/EST

The webinar can be accessed at: <https://msu.zoom.us/j/690187323>
Or visit <https://www.ashe.ws/reimaginingwebinars> for alternative ways to access the webinar.

ASHE @ASHEOFFICE
ASSOCIATION FOR THE STUDY OF HIGHER EDUCATION
f ASHE-ASSOCIATION FOR THE STUDY OF HIGHER EDUCATION
DR. KRISTEN A. RENN, 2019 ASHE PRESIDENT | DR. LESLIE D. GONZALES, 2019 PROGRAM CHAIR

Dr. Tachine

Hello everybody, [speaking in Navajo].

Dr. Crazy Bull

Hello.

Dr. Tachine

Hi. Good morning or good afternoon wherever you're from [speaking in Navajo] it's still morning over here in Arizona so I know some of you are calling on afternoon time [speaking in Navajo] [continues speaking in Navajo]. [speaking in Navajo] [continues in Navajo, continues in Navajo, continues in Navajo].

Hi everyone I introduce you to you all in Navajo, I identified my kinship relationships and I also identified where I am from, a small town called Ganado, Phoenix, Arizona, [speaking in Navajo] which means Tall Reeds and I currently live in Arizona, the lands of the Akimel O'odham and Pee Posh peoples and I'm so thrilled to join you all today on this discussion, we had a wonderful conversation to have with each of you, thank you for joining us wherever you're coming from.

Dr. Tachine

It's blessed to you with us this morning, this afternoon. Before we get started and have our guests introduce themselves, I just wanted to take care of a few things and also expressed gratitude from the Association for the Study of Higher Education, this webinar series is from the leadership of Dr Kristen Renn, and Dr. Leslie Gonzales who are really helping us to have the will to reimagine higher education and someone, read a little excerpt from their theme which encapsulates these larger conversations we're having about what does this mean in terms of reimagining ,what does it mean to have the will to reimagine higher ed.

Higher education itself is consolidating and fracturing resulting in new challenge as well exasperating a host of unresolved systemic questions of equity, responsibility and sustainability, the landscape of higher education has changed since 1976 as have the methods, data and insights that are available to us as scholars, our imaginations must follow suit, individually and collectively, it is time to reimagine, reimagining leads to breakthrough [INAUDIBLE] in theory and methods.

Reimagine the study of higher education entails a strong will, a will to overcome inertia

[BLANK_AUDIO]

Dr. Tachine

looks like I lost contact, am I back on.

[CROSSTALK] yea [INAUDIBLE].

Dr. Tachine

Looks like Dana and Megan Dr. Bang is also going, hopefully they get back on, sorry about that, [LAUGH] So as we get, I just want to acknowledged, to give thanks to ASHE organization for putting this together and for leading us on these efforts, Dr. Bang, thank you for joining us, I lost contact also.

And I also wanted to give a shout out to Dr Lori Patton Davis and Dr D.L. Stewart who started the webinar series last year with the theme of Woke Academy and I want to also acknowledge our students who are helping steward these webinar series with the technology and hoping and praying everything goes, I know Dana behind there.

I'm hoping that this goes well with the technology wise as well as Candace Hall who has been doing a lot of promoting and marketing, your work is really important to us and we want to thank you for this, for you for all the help that you've been doing, Just a little bit housekeeping too, if you are if you're on the webinar series if you have questions you can go to the chat box and the post questions there, we welcome conversation.

I will do my best to to look through the chat conversations and ask our panelists should questions arise, also if you have are joining us, if you put your microphone on mute ,we would really appreciate that and so without further ado, I want to ask our panelists to introduce themselves.

[speaking in Navajo] Dr Cheryl Crazy Bull, do you mind going first please?.

Dr. Crazy Bull

Thank you [speaking in Lakota]. [speaking in Lakota]. Good morning everyone, Cheryl Crazy Bull, my Lakota name is Wacinyanpi Win. I am from the Sicangu Lakota or Rosebud reservation in South Dakota, I'm currently serving as the President of the American Indian Fund and I'm just happy to be here with colleagues and talk about this important.

Dr. Tachine

Dr Bang [speaking in Navajo] please.

Dr. Bang

[speaking in Ojibwe] And my name of Meghan, I am, I am Ojibwe my mom's family is from Garden River and I am also the daughter of an Italian immigrant from York City, I live in Chicago which is part of my original territories currently named urban. And I am currently serving as a Senior Vice President of the Spencer Foundation, I am a faculty member in the School of Education and Social Policy and social policy and Psychology at Northwestern University [INAUDIBLE].

Dr. Tachine

Thank you Dr Keene [speaking in Navajo].

Dr. Keene

[speaking in Cherokee] Siyo nigada, Adrienne Keene dawadoa, tsi tsalagi i ayeli, Rhode Island tsinela, Hi everyone, I am Adrienne Keene, I am a citizen of the Cherokee Nation and I currently live in Wampanoag and Narragansett lands in what is currently known as Rhode Island, I'm a faculty member at Brown University, in American Studies and Ethnic Studies.

And I'm excited to be here and Dr. Tachine, I notice we have similar taste in glasses. [LAUGH].

Dr. Tachine

I just noticed that too you know. We actually do [LAUGH], that's so funny. Well thank you all for joining us today, I can't I can't express how appreciative I know all of you are so busy and this is summertime and we often are with family during this time and there's a lot of celebrations happening in our home communities with graduation, celebrations, high school, college, so forth, so thank you for sharing, carving a little of your time to talk about higher education and education in indigenous education with us today, it means so much to me, I was actually back at home just last week and it was really good to be home amongst my family as we celebrated a nephew graduating and my sister in law graduated, there's been a lot of good good feelings, I think we all can express the time a year there's a lot of good celebratory feelings as education is important for all of us, so as part of this series this is our 3rd conversation and this one, I was really excited because I get to pull together topics that are near and dear to all of us regarding indigeneity, regarding even imagination and what that looks like in terms of indigenous and higher education and so with all of you from different backgrounds, with different perspectives I think it's going to allow for really great conversations and those of you who are joining us today just know that the questions that I'm posing was co-constructed by these beautiful women, we gathered a couple months ago to talk about what we wanted to discuss with you all and so these questions although I'm asking it, isn't coming just from me, it's coming from the collective minds of the women here and so I just want to acknowledge that and so without further ado, we'll get started one of the things that we started talking about when we first talked about this topic was about inclusive and equitable environments and what does that mean.

And particularly what does that mean probably broadly speaking but also what does it mean for Indigenous peoples and perspectives so if any one of you want to begin to talk about what does that mean when we talk about inclusive and equitable environments,

[BLANK_AUDIO] anybody can add and don't feel the need to.

Dr. Bang

I think we're all waiting to see if Cheryl was going to go first. I know, I know, I hear you, I'm like totally with you Megan.

Dr. Crazy Bull

We're doing let the elder go first, [LAUGH] [CROSSTALK] yes. I'll offer two comments, one is that, you know I think the having familiarity with the experiences of Indigenous peoples is something that we

don't have in higher education, so when I think of inclusive environment, I think of everything. How teachers teach to what's in the curriculum to what symbolically occurs on campus I think about one part of it in terms of just even if you're not physically present, who you are as a people as like knowledge and [INAUDIBLE] so that's one aspect of it, and then the other aspect for me is just that removal of all of the barriers that prevent Indigenous peoples from taking advantage of post-secondary education and having that removal of barriers, I'm thinking of the positive constructs that are out there like.

Everybody should be able to have access to whatever kind of educational experience they want whether it's a tribal college, if it's a private institutions, if it's a technical school, if it's a public institution, so I think of just kind of really making sure that. That inclusivity means taking advantage of and having access to any of those opportunities so that's what my first thoughts are.

Dr. Bang

Maybe I'll keep building from there. You know I think for me, I I to be frank, I worry that inclusive, not the way that. Cheryl's talking about it but I think the way that a lot of higher ed and just where we are in thinking about inclusion and equity, it's the new word for assimilative.

That it's equal opportunity to assimilate in, into what has always been assimilative goals and I think for me, I do think, I think the challenge should be. How is it that we're creating environments where people come to thrive in their whole beings and don't and don't and I think that's what partly which I was getting at but I also have a question about whether equitable means just and so I guess I'll also say that for me I've been really trying to imagine how inclusive and equitable becomes just and transformative in some way and I think that we've been, I think everyone's been up to that for a while just to say, I don't I don't actually think that's new, I just think it's there are some trends that demand sort of clearer language about what we mean by these things and I guess as someone who thinks, actually I like I'm an educator in higher ed but a lot of my scholarship is focused on on pre-K to 12.

I've moved from thinking about learning environments that Native students succeed in or are thrive in that quite frankly have moved away from being culturally responsive, to kind of culturally resurgent and imagining learning environments that are always supporting kind of indigenous ways of knowing and being in the here and now and supporting young people kind of adaptively and generously and creatively utilizing other knowledge just them simultaneously or in addition to and for me for me I think if higher ed can move towards taking not deeply seriously, I worry for us and I guess I'll say one thing and it means for me and higher ed is one of the things that I have worked really hard on is to think about how do we create programs where students and higher ed understand how, I don't care if you're getting a degree in electrical engineering or cognitive psychology, you know how that can be a tool towards Indigenous futures and I think for an equitable higher ed there has to be support for understanding how those things contribute and can contribute to healthy Indigenous communities.

Dr. Keene

I think both of you say absolutely everything that I could imagine and I may only really touch on two things that I am currently struggling with in my own institution is that this language of inclusion and equity oftentimes is not correct framing when we're thinking about Native students, because I'm coming against a lot of challenges when I am saying that we need differentiated resources for Native students don't necessarily look like what other students of color, other marginalized students might need or are

receiving, some of the push back from my institution is well all of our resources are for everyone, they're equitable. They're across all the communities, and that can be a challenge and I definitely agree with what Megan was saying about language of inclusion is sometimes bearing towards language of assimilation or acculturation into these predominately white institutions that are grounded in non Native ways of knowing, so I think for me I think a lot about I think the need to continue to imagine, build and transform, or start to imagine, build and transform, and then also, maintain the practices, of harm reduction in the spaces so that things.

Dr Crazy Bull was talking about with like the visual representations, what are your the names of your buildings, are their land acknowledgements on your university campus, what are the ways that local Indigenous communities are being brought in, all if these practices that are extremely important, they might not transform the university in themselves but they can engage in harm reduction to make the spaces more positive environments for Native students as we're continuing to build and transform.

Dr. Tachine

Yeah that totally brings up one of my things that I been probably more frustrated with recently is when we talking about equity and inclusion, is these terms is how often Indigenous people are not included in those conversations, when you read the reports, you know Indigenous students and just peoples are not included, and so I'm I'm one of the like, one of the logic of erasure, we're constantly being erased right, I love this framing of how it is a new form of which you said Megan, about becoming from an assimilation, like we have to be to the norms of you know these normative outcomes, that are oftentimes, you know, contrary to what we see in our communities as wanting to demonstrate, and what's successful, so I feel like that's where we can learn a lot from Tribal colleges and universities, you know, they provide such a wonderful wealth of understanding of how they are determining success within their student body, within their communities, and so Dr Crazy Bull, I know that you have a wealth of experience in this capacity, could you share with us all of what you experience in terms of the knowledge we gain from Tribal college and universities because I feel like they're just a beautiful brilliance for us to think about, particular I think of higher ed in general in a general sense.

Dr. Crazy Bull

I'm a little intimidated by the "all that you know".

Dr. Tachine

Oh I know, I'm sorry [LAUGH].

Dr. Crazy Bull

A bit, a little bit, well yeah, I'll share this in the context of what can predominantly white institutions learn and then what can we as who are working in this, doing this work, what can we aspire to, so in my work with Tribal colleges and universities, there are, I think there's a lot to learn on the positive side, one being you know the mission of Tribal colleges which is about nation building and of course we know that public higher education in this country is about building the United States and, but your have a

colleges to varying degrees focus on how can they build the experiences of people in their communities around restoration and revitalization of language, a culture and traditional arts and kinship, and all those things, those qualities that make up our communities, and which are you know very diverse across a wide range of experiences and I also, you know want to acknowledge that so many of our people live away from our reservation communities which are often either on our homelands or we've been displaced and we've created a homeland, kind of where, where we've been displaced to, so but we need those communities because of the land that exists there and the Tribal governments that exist there because the Tribal governments are really representative as, whether we like it or not, they're very representative of our nation status, so we need those communities regardless of where our people might live, um you know throughout country, so I think I have a colleges then are really representative of that aspect of our nation building and that they're created from the sovereign status of our Tribal nations to educate their own people or socialize their own peoples, so how do colleges have an inherent aspect around their structure and their mission and their identity in that respect and then we can learn a lot from the struggles that the Tribal colleges have had in the last 50 some years, Tribal colleges have tried to avoid being assimilated or acculturated into American higher education and you see that, experience with like accreditation or with the way academic programs are designed or I use teacher education as an example, teacher education which really should be rooted in how do you Native teach children is often heavily influenced by what the state thinks.

Teacher education should look like, so you have this, the struggles that Tribal colleges have gone through in that space, a lot can be learned from that struggle, how do you resist, right and present, do something that really fulfills your peoples' mission, so, Tribal colleges have all those aspects of curriculum, you know how to teach Native students how to work in Tribal communities, you know how to have authentic relationships and then also how to work outside of the community, so Tribal colleges have a lot of that experience to bring. The article that, the chapter that Justin Guillory, the president with Northwestern Indian College and I did, talking about the origins of the Tribal colleges really looked at something that I think is, um real important to this conversation as well as is that Native studies programs developed kind of parallel to the development of Tribal colleges, so there was a response in predominately white institutions, kind of along the same line of the Tribal college response where people in those environments were looking to influence, transform institutions to do some of the same things, build Tribal nations you know create opportunities for Native students, just that that's a much harder system to crack so, I'd like to think that as we're learning where we're also in that parallel space. Thank you.

Dr. Tachine

Dr Bang, I'm really interesting to hear you talk a little bit more about resurgent, you mentioned earlier and I feel like it's, I just finished reading your article Indigenous Family Engagement: Strong Family, Strong Nations and those of you again, if you haven't, check it out, I highly recommend, it it's coauthored by Montañó Nolan, and McDaid-Morgan, off of the new handbook of Indigenous ed with editors McKinley and Smith, I wanted to mention that because, I feel like that's a, you provide some examples or ways of thinking that higher ed could do in terms of looking at communities, particularly around family engagement and I think that's an area, I know my work in higher ed that I feel like we're not hitting, were not, institutions do not know how to work of Indigenous families.

So what are your thoughts around that, particular around Indigenous and resurgence?

Dr. Bang

I don't know if I have a good answer to that question, so I'll share not quite public thoughts right. You know, so one of the things that I have been kind of thinking about from in my scholarship forever is how age segregation is a colonial technology and is one of the things that I think is been deliberately introduced into Native communities through education systems that is really counter to the way that I think Indigenous learning and teaching works, and so I think and I think right, the kind of history of schooling has been around disrupting our families by design, right, that was kind of a technique of war and so I think a lot about how and, and, quite frankly child removal isn't only happening, hasn't only been applied to Native communities, it's been a tool that has been used in multiple ways and we're seeing it again, play out in particular ways right now, so I say that because I think it helps frame for me about why I think about strong families and I don't, I mean, Indigenous family networks and structures by the way,

As a place for us to be designing from and with and I think that we have a very student centered models, and I appreciate that. But, and I worry about that becoming the perpetuation of a Western model, with good intent but perhaps one that won't get us to where we need and so I think we end up seeing lots of I was a first generation person, and like we see lots of response that try to hold, hold up as a student centered model and make it culturally responsive or adaptive and I think we have to do that, so I should say, that we're going to have to continue doing that, and I'm really after trying to understand what happens if we don't use that as the terms, I'm really taken with Scott Lyons idea about rhetorical sovereignty, I think about educational sovereignty in a similar way, if we think about the terms of education that we accept or decide to refuse and try something different.

So I say that because I think, um the I also, I don't know if that's true for everyone else but I will also tell you that at one point, my own community celebrated my educational successes, and then at some point I got too successful and there is a period of wondering and now that I'm a professor, sometimes that's cause for celebration and sometimes that's a cause for suspect, um amongst communities, at least in my experience that whether it's me or directed to other right, there's lots of interesting stuff around that and so, but, but I also think that what it has meant to my family has meant different kinds of things too, so I guess what I'm getting at is for me, an institution that thinks it's after an individual success behaves in particular ways and institutions that think they're after actually cultivating families and sovereignty for me, the whole point of that article is that Native families make up Native nations.

Dr. Bang

And so the transformation for me is recognizing that there isn't a, that the segregation or the distinction between those things hasn't served us well historically and and maybe we need to think a little bit differently and then I think I think one of the thing and that's why I said really a good answer to your higher ed question but what I have also recognize is that decisions about and I feel like the Tribal colleges and universities are our Tribal community saying no more.

I think there is a deep, what, healthy communities, nations decide things like what their kids should know, how they should learn it, who should teach it, why it matters, those are all acts of what sovereign peoples decide about how to raise their next generations and it's also the thing that has deliberately been severed in some ways right, and so so I also think that like part of the process for me, is how we are including families in the broader process of educational self-determination.

I think is hard, it's why I think we have an under representation of Native teachers in the workforce because learning to do the work of teaching and learning, we're in the process of regenerating educators across all sectors of our lives, right we have tons of educators in our communities, they just don't come to the fore from all institutions all the time or we're not preparing them there and I think it's partly because of, Cheryl talked about state decides what teacher education is and I think that there are lots of us are like, yeah I don't want to do that too deeply, I think you have to be pretty far along to.

Dr. Bang

To manage that but I do, I guess I'll just end on saying this, I think that We're in the process of transforming families' relationships to education and I think if, for many of us, education was the source of trauma, was the source of a lot of community or family, or familial problems but if we're not approaching an understanding that we're actually after a massive paradigm shift about what's possible with education, then we, then we treat families, Native or not quite frankly, from deficit ideologies where kids are positioned to think their families were part of the problem.

And so, so for me actually recognizing that the institution is changing its relationship to families and Tribes is actually most important instead of sort of seeing, I think we think lots of teaching families how to support your kids in higher ed, which may be part of it, but but it tends to perpetuate the problem's on the family side, not on the institutional side.

Dr. Tachine

That's a really good point which makes me one think about your work Adrienne, working with College Horizons, particularly what Native Pride, College Pride, your piece that came out of Harvard Review, because that program is culturally relevant connected to Indigenous families, and is really deconstructing how college access programs are intricately connected our relationships, right and relationships with family, could you speak to, how I feel that's a model for institutions and thinking about Family and resurgence and sovereignty and Native nationhood, I think that those are tenets that College Pride, Native Pride, College Horizon does, I may be wrong but please, let me let us know your thoughts on that.

Dr. Keene

Sure, it's so College Horizons is a precollege access program that was started in 1999, and it serves American Indian and Alaskan Native and Native Hawaiian students, entering into their junior or senior year of high school and, on its surface it's a college prep program where the students emerge at the end of the week with like a list of 10 schools, some are good fits for them, their, are common application

filled out, their financial aid forms filled out, an essay that been through 3 or 4 drafts but the magic of College Horizons is that it is a program that has been grounded in Indigenous relationships and understanding what it means to be in relationship and in relation with one another and with our nations and with the land, and with our non human relatives and all of these pieces that go into being an Indigenous person, and what I see is really transformative about that space is that most of the faculty who make up the program are admission officers from colleges and universities around the country and are non Native, and a lot of them have never worked with Native students before coming to the program, but from the first day they are pressed into this environment that is an Indigenous space where we take as many hours we need to do introductions fully and well, where everyone gets to use their language and talk about where they're from.

Where we have an elder come in, do an opening prayer to set the program in a good way, to talk about the land that we're on, these markers that show the students that there doesn't have to be conflict between, you know college pride and Native pride, that bringing everyone in these relationships together, is what can really transform the experience of higher ed for the students and knowing that those relationships can be formed with non native people, that we can bring folks into those reciprocal relationships in a good way is really powerful and the program talks a lot about the language of Nation building and what does it mean for you not just to be a Native, a college student, but a Native college student and what additional responsibilities or connections do you have that other students might not be challenged by in an academic environment and what are ways that your citizenship in your nation means that your degree can get, I'm trying to move away from the language or giving back which is something that we can talk about too.

The ways that you can contribute to the building up of your nation, in a way that is indigenous to, so not just replicating a sort of Western nation state model of what a Nation looks like but what is an Indigenous nation look like and what is it made up of and who is it made up of and all those webs of relationships that we're all in, so College Horizon to me is a really beautiful example of a way that just by being unapologetically Indigenous, by thinking really strategically about the messages and language that we want students to emerge from the program with.

And completely grounding it in a those Indigenous, reciprocal, respectful relationships, you can create incredible webs of knowledge and support that will continue through students' college, through the termination of their college degrees.

Dr. Tachine

I'm really excited to see your evolving work on there because Dr Keene is actually working on some writing about this and so, stay tuned as her work evolves and we're able to learn from the work that College Horizon does does, we can learn a lot from these programs that center Indigeneity and how we can rethink about what we can do to deconstruct or normalize working patterns in higher ed generally speaking.

I'm going to switch gears here because I feel like another, I don't know if its a, what is it, a movement or you know I'm trying to think of the terminology but just this idea of acknowledging Indigenous place right, that's happening within institutions, within conference, I've seen it more so at conferences, also recently but this idea of institutions and structures recognizing the land in which either they residing on,

or their institution sits upon and we're, I know at Arizona State University, Dr Crow made a statement a while back and probably was one of the first presidents to make a large statement that was sent throughout campus, and has working in, with ways in which, to what does that really mean and I think a lot of us are talking about these, this, this, this, timing and so I'm curious to hear from you all, what are your thoughts are about when institutions acknowledge Indigenous place this place and what are some.

Yeah just, I'll just stop there, what are some thoughts

[BLANK_AUDIO] [BLANK_AUDIO]

Dr. Bang

Dr Crazy Bull, I see you, you just [INAUDIBLE].

Dr. Crazy Bull

OK I'll say something first, I just. Although I'm happy to have Megan and Adrienne, say things first as well. You know I think that the experience that I'm having, this was new to me, I have to say that this actually came from people like yourselves because in my experience has always been place based, right because of the nature of a working in um Tribally controlled education and so I've learned a lot, from the fact that there is a, an intention that that experience would um, I think force people in influential places, in leadership roles, it would force students and others to look at the history of how higher education came to be in this country and how higher education is complicit in the taking of Indigenous people's lands and complicit in um the participation of taking away cultural practices and identity, so I think it has this really big intention and to me it's just like a baby yet, it's an it's just barely getting started, I don't think we know entirely what that looks like, I had this experience at a conference I was at in California where Carrie Billy, the President of American Indian Higher Education Consortium, she got up to give the land acknowledgement for the Tribal college convening and she gave a history of what had happened to Indigenous peoples in California and I thought when I was listening to her, there it is, because it was more than getting up and saying, This land is the Tongva peoples' land, it was, here's what happened to Indigenous people here, and I think what that's what we intend that to be and I think it's really wonderful that we have people in our communities that can tell that story to us so we can share that story more broadly as well, so that's my observation of that.

Dr. Bang

So I think that was, exactly what it could be so I appreciate that Dr Crazy Bull. There's two things that I just wanted to say, I love that you said it was in its infancy in and I think that as long as everyone understand it's in its infancy and it's it's not the end and I'm happy about that, and I feel you just played out why it's important, and I also wanted to just highlight one thing that makes me hopeful about it, so Dr Crazy Bull you said so it was new to me because I'm always place based, and one of the things that I think is happening for people everywhere is the going invisibility of place from thought, that is bad for humans everywhere and so for me there's also this way that it also, not only is it a way for us to enact I think and and refuse erase, but it invites people to be place based in their thinking always and so for me that's a hopeful part of a possibility here, that not only can I think it could be the beginning of making

sure our our stories and histories and places are always visible, but it could teach everyone to be placed based in your thinking, that is just not the case whether it's about Indigenous people or anything right, there is a way that Western thought is increasingly de-placed and problematic in its dispossession from place.

Dr. Tachine

That reminds me of AERA's, this past AERA's land acknowledge where Dr Eve Tuck and many others that I can't [recall] names, I apologize but rather than calling it a land acknowledgement, they called it a call to acknowledge is the land and water, so it's really being more mindful of this idea of, we are all connected to the lands, and the waters and take appreciation of the blessings that's afforded us to be able to live and to walk on the land and to breathe the air and drink the water, which as I feel it is what you're sharing Dr Bang, is that you really to acknowledge that existence that we're blessed to have a connection to that, yea that's a beautiful reminder, I love that, Dr. Keene?.

Dr. Keene

I'm just so happy that I get to be in this conversation, I am taking frantic notes of all these things that I want to return to you, and think more about. And I agree completely with my fellow panelists that, to me it, land acknowledgements are our very first step that folks can take and I think what, Dr Bang and Dr Crazy Bull are saying as well is that that can't be the only step and I think that that is the challenge that we get in some of our higher ed institutions, I think having the language being read is kind of a checkbox at the beginning of events or at the bottom of a program for an event or things like that is enough.

and Hayden King who is a scholar in what is currently known as Canada, was talking about his involvement in drafting his university's land acknowledgement statement which acknowledges the treaty of the land that they are on and he said that if he could redo it, he would add a statement at the end that is along the lines and I'm paraphrasing, but this what that compels me to do, and asking people to be really intentional about not just acknowledging but thinking about what this compels me to do or the, what that relationship actually means.

But I will definitely say is that as a Native person who is living in a community where Indigenous folks are really invisible, it's, there is still something really powerful for me when I hear those land acknowledgements especially when I'm not expecting them by colleagues that I didn't know were aware of this movement towards acknowledging land, so if I;m at an event, I will immediately perk up and see what's happening.

If that, if that acknowledgement is done, so, I like the idea of it being in its infancy, in its beginning stages and I think you look to some of our other relatives in what is currently known as Canada or place like Australia and New Zealand, who've been doing these acknowledgements for a lot longer, to look at models and then also see ways that language can evolve in thinking of new ways of acknowledging land that brings us more that phase, and this is what that compels me to do.

Dr. Bang

I mean, can I ask a question of this group, [CROSSTALK] yea, please, It's really interesting to me, I've had lots of people say to me, well I don't do one because I'm afraid I'm going to do it wrong.

Dr. Keene

Same.

Dr. Bang

And and I think that's a really, I'm curious what people think about this and I'll share what my response has been and I'm curious if people think this is wrong, this is a genuine question now that we're having this conversation. I have said that I would rather have people try and be willing to be corrected, I've also told them to do their homework, like it's not a hard to figure out.

But but to me, part of the reason that I find it really heartening to hear even an attempt, is because for me, in spaces where I've never heard that or where I'm actually assume that, like I'll be in a place and I'll have to work on refusing complete invisibility and erasure, it's a signal to put to a potential that wasn't there before and so I'm more forgiving of the must, of a land acknowledgment done badly but earnestly versus a land acknowledgement that feels like a check, did that inclusive practice, and I'm just I'm curious about how people feel and I'm, I don't know who's on but I was thinking about like I wonder how many people are thinking, ooh I don't do that, should I do it?

What happens if I don't do it very well, so I'm curious what other people think?

Dr. Keene

I get that question a lot to um, I do a lot of public speaking and so I'm going to campuses all the time and doing talks and I have a little like form that goes to the universities to help them prepare for my visit, and part of what I put on there and there's just a single question, it says like who's Indigenous land does your university occupy, and it's so interesting how many folks at universities that throws for a complete loop and they get really stressed out and nervous about it and they call and try and figure out what the correct language they should be using is and it just really like they get all concerned by it, but I am very much along the same lines, I feel like the attempt to figure out that knowledge is important, like, that process of, I don't give people the answer, even though I could very easily find it out, I want them to do that work, to try and figure it out.

And to do that labor for themselves. And then as long as there is that earnest attempt and I think that the key part that you said Dr Bang is, the willingness to be corrected, I think and being able to be humble with that acknowledgement and recognize that it might not be exactly right or pronunciation is not right, or the language is not quite right but being willing to listen to someone who's offering that feedback or correction is all that I ask for.

Dr. Crazy Bull

The over achiever in me, wants the land acknowledgement that I give, to be perfect. [LAUGH] But you know that's, my first reaction to that question Megan was, the, that part of this is people's racism right

because, it's just like I don't want to acknowledge, I want to say I'm colorblind or I want to say that or that's too hard for me to try to figure out how you're experiencing race as a person of color, so sure that might require some investigation, it might require people to spend some time asking other people but I think they should do that because I think that excuse themselves saying well I can't do it, I might not do it perfectly.

That to me is just some other form of race, racial behaviors that are inappropriate.

Dr. Tachine

And I like this idea of when we think about it as an infant because like with the Navajo philosophy, with the little ones you know, where we're trying to have them but they're allowing them to do their own also and it's the multigenerational also seeking advice from the grandma you know or asking for guidance but still it's just letting them know that they make a mistake it's okay, they tried, so I really agree with your thinking around that But what I also think and acknowledge that I make mistakes too and so I think that's important to not assume that all Indigenous people know everything about this Indigenous places, land and so forth and so I go into this place recognizing too that I am an infant in a lot of my learning and understanding and trying really hard to to develop and grow but but coming in with a good heart and intentions I think it really is where it comes from, as you're really coming with a good heart intentions, then racism, all those thought of you know aren't a part of your your mode of thinking in those ways, so I appreciate this conversation on that and I do like this idea of this infancy but there is then a development stage that we have to grow up [CROSSTALK] right, we have to grow up about this and we can't, we're not going to be at the toddler stage for a long time, I mean there's a new season coming and so there's a time when we have to do development, that next stage of learning, understanding.

Dr. Crazy Bull

So it's hard for me to because the Lakotas, we think we were everywhere so pretty much a lot of the land is ours [LAUGH]. Like oh wait is that somebody else land?.

Dr. Bang

[CROSSTALK] that's funny, You know. Can I know Amanda if you want to go on to another question that, one of the things that I like about where we just got to, makes me think you know Dr Vine Deloria's work around human maturation and for me part of the family engagement is that if we, if we interacted with each other like we were relatives, [CROSSTALK] yea, we behave differently and it would be far more loving if we were doing it in healthful familial relations than, with the histories of nation states mediating how we hear and respond to each.

Just to say that I feel like for me that's a massive shift in kind of both human maturation in the way that Dr Deloria wrote about and healthful relations in general.

Dr. Tachine

Well you know, we've been, I want to be cognizant of time but we've been talking about visibility for sometime, like putting little nods and I feel like this is a good segue into that because this idea of Indigenous land and presence, to me is really along visibility and invisibility and I think Megan you brought that up as well, so so I'm curious to hear from you all your thoughts around ideas of invisibility but also how are ways in which we can raise visibility but knowing that in the raising of visibility of Indigenous peoples, there's still some complexity in that right, in terms of the what is visible, what is shared upon in terms of Indigeneity and so I want to share that and I know that Dr Crazy Bull's been doing some really wonderful work with the Reclaiming Native Truth Project, which really helped us see visibility at a national level and so if you can speak a little bit about that and just your thoughts about The College Fund is working on some ways to raise visibility for Native students in higher ed, I'd love that, start us off.

Dr. Crazy Bull

Yeah thank you, so Reclaiming Native Truth was a two year national study that work on what are the views of American society about Indigenous peoples, if they have any and whether some narrative changes that could be made, based on what we've learned from those views, Adrienne was part of that as well, so she's very familiar with it also, and it now it's transitioned where an organization called IllumiNative is going to really is focusing on how do you facilitate narrative change targeting your story and and building people's understanding of your story as Indigenous peoples, And so there's a lot of work that will be going on, kind of looking, I want to say that the thing that is of the greatest value for me is that it isn't just a story of here's how we're alike.

But it's a story of here's our share in humanity, and here's how we're different, here's how we as Indigenous people experience the world differently, we have different ways of knowing, we have the kinship, we have all of these char...and we're distinctive Nations where we have nation status. So I think that that, lots of people, you can learn all about it by going to Reclaiming Native Truth.

Googling that or going to IllumiNative to kind of look at the progress in that space and you'll just see more and more unfolding in the next couple of years about that but Amanda, you know joined my team working on and a higher education equity initiative which still is, has momentum and what we basically did with that initiative was gather information and gather people and talk about what are some of the specific actions that we could ask higher education institutions to do, in order to increase the visibility of Native peoples, things like producing data specifically about Native people, or highlighting your relationships with Tribal partners and kind of giving advice about how to do that kind of consultation or are actively providing a place for students to be, changing the curriculum of your school so that higher education curriculum is more, has more information about Native peoples in it, so there's a lot of recommendations, there people can see that particular report by going to The College Fund's website and looking at that but you'll be seeing more action in that space as well and it's very connected to visibility discussion from Reclaiming Native Truth, thank you.

Dr. Tachine

Megan, or Adrienne you want to speak a little bit of your thoughts about invisibility and I'm saying the invisibility with parentheses around" in" and that speaks from this idea of Dr Dr Braveboy's work on,

that we are invisibility and visibility is constrained and it's created by powers of control, within our control and out of our control, and that there's challenges with that, so how we are negotiating through that is kind of the, kind of the brief, probably not a well thought out definition from my interpretation of invisibility with parentheses.

Dr. Keene

Yeah well Dr Tachine, and Dr Chris Nelson and I wrote a piece about that challenge that we call the double, the double edged sword of visibility, of being one of few Indigenous grad students was what we were talking about. But I mean the invisibility [INAUDIBLE] of students in universities settings is so, in predominately white institutions, is so real, we had our Native graduation ceremonies two days ago which was absolutely beautiful but we had 6 graduates including undergrad and graduate for all of Brown, that were getting their degrees and so when we think about what that represents in terms of the entire student body, invisibility and that erasure is so real and then thinking about the flip side of the visibility is so, from an institutional level, you can feel completely invisible and be made invisible on the campuses by being erased in the statistics reporting for things, being erased in the curriculum, being erased in the not seeing faculty that look like you etc etc but then in the kind of individual level, students can also feel very hypervisible, in their identity, They are the only Native student in their classes and so it's all eyes on them when the one topic of Indigenous issues pops up or they're walking across campus in some regalia or Native bling and suddenly all eyes are on them because they've been made other you know and so even though on the institutional level, they're getting erased and feeling invisible, there's that feeling of tokenization sometimes, the challenges of feeling hypervisible in your identity, when there just aren't people who are like you on campus.

And both sides of that worked together so, it's not one or the other, it's both of them together and create a really challenging experience for students of feeling erased and hypervisible at the same time.

Dr. Bang

Mostly just to add something because I feel like they just both answered this, you know to me part of what it becomes, one of my mentors once told me that her whole, Carol Lee talked about that her whole point of this school that she created for African-American students was to create environments where their humanity was never in question and I think for me, one of the things that I love about that Reclaiming Native Truth and what we're talking about, is can we create places in which Indigenous presence is never questioned and so we're talking about how visibility or invisibility functions as a, as a kind of processes that we develop mental processes that I think students have to learn how to navigate and I guess for me, the extent to which we can create conditions for survivance and resurgence which is partly what I see as the movement in the in the Reclaiming Native Truth and the kind of diversity and heterogeneity that Dr Crazy Bull just talk about, is about refusing the tokenization that I think Dr Keene is talking about right, that that actually our survivance is predicated on us refusing a kind of narrow definition and only being allowed to be visible in particular ways, and I think, you know the extent to which we're in a generation of demanding an expansion, means for me whenever I teach classes I asked so what does this mean for a 5 year old, right what it, what is, what is, how are we designing for 5 year olds not to have to wonder about their visibility and how would we get towards institutions where this dynamic of invisibility or visibility no longer mediates our experiences.

Dr. Tachine

Yeah I like this idea of visibility connected with presence, because I feel like so connected to belonging and that's kind of where I'm thinking about now, and visibility and invisibility is about belonging because I feel like, it's so connected to a student to a place, to feeling like they belong in this contested because Indigenous land where they're originally from, but the institutions on these lands is where they're feeling this unsettled belonging and so I feel like there's a ten, there's a conversation about visibility and it's close connections with a belonging, who belongs, and how can we create more belongingness for students our institutions.

I want to move forward with this conversation and when we're talking about these challenges that are existing with an institution and some hope as well, you've shared some of that, why why then is education important for Indigenous students, knowing that they may come into places that creates and invisible, that invisibilizes them, that where there may be racist experiences, so what are your thoughts about why, what about that about Indigenous education in higher ed?.

[CROSSTALK] okay me again [LAUGH], you're awesome.

Dr. Crazy Bull

I'm awesome today, so, you know I when I think of education and all of us on this call here have withstood that invisibility and withstood having to leave our home in order to go to college. And seeing the experiences that others, friends and relatives have or people [INAUDIBLE] who we may not know are Indigenous peoples, so we all have that understanding but when I think about education [INAUDIBLE] you know I think about the thing that our grandparents wanted for us, was for us to be able to take care of ourselves and our families, and I used to always say that to, and I still do say that to students, that the reason that you go to college is because we have things that we have to take care of, we have to take care of our families and we have to take care of our homes and we have to take care of you know our land, and all the rest of creation and in today's modern society, one of the ways that we can do that is to educate ourselves in order to take care of the resources or the responsibilities that we have, so I think that, I think that's true for young people as well, you know I tell high school and middle school kids that same thing, talk to my own family members, your education gives you resources and tools and we all have the ability to withstand the kinds of things that institutions do, [INAUDIBLE] institutions that want to make you invisible or they want to take away your power, we have the capability of withstanding those things, we come from a people who withstood those things for hundreds of years and we are part of a people who are withstanding those things now, so we don't have to be defeated by the challenges that those institutions create for us.

We can do differently and I just think you know education is one way, I think our people have a right to other kinds of things, maybe they go right into the workforce, maybe they're a stay at home family member, you know maybe they decide to go into the service, I know a lot of people make those choices, my whole thing is like you know what you should get to go wherever you want and have a great experience, whatever that is and I believe we have the individual capability and group capability to make that true, so that's my lecture as well [LAUGH].

Dr. Tachine

That's a good one, I love it, any other thoughts, Adrienne or Megan.

Dr. Bang

I was just going to say mic drop the, [UNKNOWN].

Dr. Keene

[CROSSTALK] good good, I mean I think this is something that I'm thinking about a lot with the the book and I am currently working on, is just this question of why a college, if all of the research we have, is like the Native students really struggle in these spaces and they're not built for us and what is then the value of sending your students off into these spaces and I have been thinking a lot about the ways that our communities have, we, the narrative of Indigenous people is that we are somehow stuck in historic past and there was this time in, our cultures were pure back then or something but the reality is that our communities have always been adapting, transforming, using new technologies as they come into our communities and making them part of who we are people and using them to improve and develop our communities, so especially like Cherokee people have always done that, so thinking about the ways it higher education, Western higher education can offer those spaces for our community members to really do some of that dramatic imagining of what our communities can be and take those knowledges and skills and adapt and transform them into things that will serve our communities and Wayne Yang has an amazing little book that just has completely changed my life and all of my students' lives called *The Third University Is Possible* and in it, he uses this idea of scyborg as being what he calls system interference or the ghost in the machine, so that students can be in a university but not of it and they can be witnessing and seen inside this sort of colonial machines that the verbs he uses that I love, to remix and retool, into something that is beneficial for our communities, so to me that is kind of the moving towards an answer of why college is that it's a place where we can continue to do what we have always done which is to grab a hold of new technologies and figure out how they benefit our communities, it's a place where we can come together and learn from one another which is something that Dr Bang posted about, the idea of academic conferences as being something that Indigenous people have always done, we've always come together to share knowledges and so it's a lot of reframing these spaces not from just this complete conflict for me, from this complete conflict orientation orientation and not that you are going into battle, that you are here to fight that you are going to have this this struggle and this challenge but that it is a place of possibility and that you can make it into something that is beneficial for not just you as an individual, which is what the university is designed to do, which is benefit you as an individual but to is to look at it from that Indigenous perspective making it beneficial to your entire community, your nation, to Indigenous peoples as a whole.0 And so that thinking it is to me where we need to be going in terms of what college can do for our communities.

Dr. Tachine

Ah Beautiful, thank you for sharing and just want to put a plug that la paperson, A Third University is Possible, is speaking with us, as part of this webinar in the fall, so Wayne Yang will be in conversation with us about that piece and so so good for us to know we're all kind of reading some of the similar thinking and what people are sharing with us, which is a good segue, I'm curious what are you all reading, what are you listening to, what's your podcast, what's on your playlist.

What get's you going an aspires you, when you're doing this work?.

Dr. Keene

I can start that one if you want, I read so much speculative fiction, that is my like every night before I go to bed to try and clear out my brain of all of the academic things I've been reading and thinking about, I read pretty much only speculative fiction written by women of color.

Specifically Black women and Native women, so right now I am very into Rebecca Roanhorse wrote the second in her Trail of Lightening series, she's an Ohkay Owingeh and Black author, that that book is really amazing, I'm reading a ton of Octavia Butler, a ton of NK Jemisin, so just these women who are giving us spaces to imagine a world that is different than the one that we are in now.

And the ways that a lot of times relationships play out in the that and can be really beneficial for me as I'm trying to reimagine and think about futures beyond settle colonialism, beyond this institution that I'm in. That's why I love reading speculative fiction. Indigenous futurisms are like my new obsession.

Dr. Bang

Yeah I'll tell you I'm reading lots of grants these days [LAUGH] Just to say. [LAUGH]. I'll say this in all seriousness though, one of the most amazing privileges of my new role is to read everybody's most hopeful ideas. About how to make change, like that's the kind of beauty of the purview that I have, and I get to see it across so I actually am pretty nurtured by that to be honest because it it asked me to see more broadly than perhaps I would all the time, the other think that I'll tell you that I have so, I read your Gerald Vizner over and over and over and over again and I also Leanne Simpson over and over and over again.

So I would say those two and then you know, there is this series of new things that I have coming, that I have been thinking about, so Lugones got some really interesting book around pilgrimages, I've been really after ideas about understanding movement. Potentially different. That that and I'm telling you honestly like conceptually, as a person who is part of a relocated family, the narratives about movements and migrations typically have pretty negative connotations to them and I've been trying to reimagine how might we better understand our our migrations of movements, from places of strength and resilience and resurgence, rather than the stories of our of our harm.

And there's a series of works so I'll say that, and then the last one I have to tell you, I've been listening to snotty nose [INAUDIBLE] kids a lot lately [LAUGH] so I've been trying really hard, I have teenagers right and I've been trying to remember music as intellectual work, so I've been listening to them a lot, I'm an old school jazz fan, someone told me I was from the golden era of hip hop the other day, which I both resented and appreciated and felt like I still wanted to say thank you and, not sure that I've ever been called golden era anything, [LAUGH] so, and I have been listening to Dr Keene's podcast, recently.

There's a couple of, I've been listening to Eve Tuck has one, there's a series of these gorgeous podcasts and that have, as these lovely collaboration between scholars and leaders and communities and all kinds of ways that I feel like is this really interesting kind of hybrid intellectual indigenous space, that is opening up in the air waves, and so it's also not text based which I've totally been digging.

Yeah and so shout out for my relations podcasts, if you haven't, check it out do, that's one of the things I listened to when I was trying back to Ganado when I was driving back with my cousin so I made the time, go listening to that but also Eve Tuck's The Henceforth is that, did I say it right? is another podcast that's out there that's really good, so I want to put those out there. [speaking in Navajo] Dr. Crazy Bull, what are you reading listening to dancing to?

Dr. Crazy Bull

Well so I'm not a different stage in my career so I don't necessarily feel like I'm, doing a lot of reading that's related to career development so I just want to fess that up. Because I do read, I have a very diverse and eclectic reading and music and balance of life belief system that I evolved into, you know about partly related to my my age and that years of experience, so I just read all kinds of things and including I've read some of the speculative fiction that was mentioned, I listen to some of the podcasts that were mentioned.

I really try to have balance when it comes to, I sew and bead a lot, I take lots of walks, trying to get exercise, things like that and I just want to encourage you, all of you and listeners on the podcast, practice a lot of self care, something that I wish I was better at, when I was in my forty's.

Especially taking better care of your skin because that's something that you don't think about until you get into my age group, I will offer a couple of things that are hopeful for me, in recent months I've, instead authoring articles by myself, I've reached out to try to co-author articles and that's made a big difference for me in terms of inspiration, being able to work with particularly younger scholars, so that they have that opportunity to publish because I get invited to publish, because I've done some, and I want to expand that opportunity and create the opportunity more for others, so that's been very inspiring for me to be able to do that to see more people writing about the Tribal colleges and universities, because that's just there's just not enough writing out there about those institutions and then, I think another real area of inspiration for me is that I really read a lot of poetry and I listen to a lot of rock and roll, I discovered driving across the state of Nebraska that I don't really like modern country music all that much so [LAUGH].

Good for rock and roll, and I fess up to people all the time that I'm a person who reads a lot of murder mysteries where people do awful terrible things to other people but justice wins in the end so.

Dr. Tachine

That's one of the things that I loved learning from you Cheryl is you, I remember putting me aside and really talk to me about, you know having balance and just kind of your your system of how you keep track of things and I really thank you for that and it's a good reminder to hear all of those ways that

you'd instill in us, and I also want to do a shout out for one of your pieces that you just published with Emily White Hat, and it's called and if I say it wrong, please Cangleska Wakan.

Dr. Crazy Bull

Cangleska Wakan: The Ecology of The.

Dr. Tachine

Go ahead I'm sorry, go ahead.

Dr. Crazy Bull

Cangleska Wakan means sacred circle.

Dr. Tachine

Yes and that's the title, The Ecology of the Sacred Circle and The Role of Tribal Colleges and Universities, it's a wonderful read in the International Review of Education, which she talks, they both write about the powerful role of Tribal colleges as being a place based, and so that just came out, so it's a good example of her writing with people that you just shared about and the value of that collective thinking, it's a way of rhetorical sovereignty right, is deconstructing is just a one way, one way of knowing that we are write and think and do things together collectively and so that's a wonderful piece to that, Well thank you all of you for your time, it's already 75, we're already went through the time and I just learned so much from each of you and just, ahéhee [Navajo], giving you a big hug from Arizona, for sharing your time, your expertise and your knowledge with us and those of you who are on, I encourage you to explore their writing, they're all beautiful thinkers, as you got a sense and there's a lot out there, what they're doing and the good work that they're doing in terms of Indigeneity and beyond, helping us think about how we can be a better and go good in our communities, within our institutions and in our families and so, I know each of them have taught me to be a better person and I want to say, ahéhee, to each of you for doing that for me and for many others, So without further ado, I just want to also make a shout out that we'll reconvene the webinar in the fall semester, where we have a really great series set, we have three more and so we'll put, we'll put those things, those announcements on social media, and let you all know, and thank you for tuning in, I apologize if we didn't get to all the questions that were coming in, but I hope we were able to provide some good thoughts for you to continue to grow and learn, ahéhee.

Dr. Crazy Bull

Thank you,

Dr. Keene

Thank you, thank you [CROSSTALK] Bye, Bye.